

Date of Hearing: March 20, 2024

ASSEMBLY COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION
Al Muratsuchi, Chair
AB 1929 (McKinnor) – As Amended February 26, 2024

[This bill is double referred to the Assembly Higher Education Committee and will be heard by that Committee as it relates to issues under its jurisdiction.]

SUBJECT: Career technical education: data collection

SUMMARY: Requires local education agencies (LEAs) receiving funding through the Career Technical Education Incentive Grant (CTEIG) Program, in reporting required data metrics to the California Department of Education (CDE), to disaggregate those metrics by race. Also requires consortia receiving funding through the K-14 Strong Workforce Program (SWP) to collect data on career technical education (CTE) outcomes, disaggregated by race. Specifically, **this bill:**

- 1) Requires that data metrics required to be reported to CDE annually by LEAs receiving funding through the CTEIG program be disaggregated by race, including the following:
 - a) The high school graduation rate;
 - b) The number of pupils completing career technical education coursework;
 - c) The number of pupils meeting academic and career-readiness standards as defined in the College/Career Indicator associated with the California School Dashboard;
 - d) The number of pupils obtaining an industry-recognized credential, certificate, license, or other measure of technical skill attainment;
 - e) The number of former pupils employed and the types of businesses in which they are employed; and
 - f) The number of former pupils enrolled in each of the following:
 - i) A postsecondary educational institution;
 - ii) A state apprenticeship program; and
 - iii) A form of job training other than a state apprenticeship program.
- 2) Requires each consortium receiving funding through the K-14 SWP to collect data on CTE outcomes, disaggregated by race.

EXISTING LAW:

- 1) Authorizes the CTEIG Program as a state education, economic, and workforce development initiative with the goal of providing students in kindergarten through 12th grade with the knowledge and skills necessary to transition to employment and postsecondary education (Education Code (EC) 53070).

- 3) Appropriates funding for the CTEIG program as follows: \$400 million for 2015-16; \$300 million for 2016-17; \$200 million for 2017-18; and \$150 million per year for 2018-19 to 2020-21; and \$300 million per year beginning in the 2021-22 fiscal year and every year thereafter.
- 4) Defines grant recipients for CTEIG as one or more school districts, county offices of education (COE), charter schools, regional occupational centers or programs (ROCPs) operated by joint power authorities or COEs, or any combination of these.
- 5) Requires the CDE to annually submit the list of recommended new and renewal grant recipients to the State Board of Education (SBE) for review and approval prior to making annual grant awards. CDE and SBE, in determining proposed grant recipients, are required to give positive consideration and the greatest weight to those applicants who:
 - i) Serve unduplicated students or subgroups with higher than average dropout rates;
 - ii) Are located in an area of the state with a high unemployment rate; and
 - iii) Offer an existing high-quality regional-based CTE program as a joint powers agency (JPA) or COE.
- 6) Requires the CDE and the SBE, in determining proposed grant recipients to also give positive consideration to those applicants who:
 - i) Successfully leverage existing CTE resources and funding, as well as contributions from industry, labor, and philanthropic sources;
 - ii) Engage in regional collaborations with postsecondary education or other LEAs, including the SWP consortium operating in their areas, as well as pathway programs provided under an adopted California and Career Access Pathways partnership agreement;
 - iii) Make significant investments in CTE infrastructure, equipment, and facilities; and
 - iv) Operate within rural districts.
- 7) Data reporting requirements for CTEIG grantees including the core metrics required by the federal Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V), the quality indicators described in the California State Plan for CTE, as well as additional specified metrics. Requires the California Workforce Pathways Joint Advisory Committee to review the data metrics annually and make recommendations on whether these data metrics remain the most appropriate metrics to evaluate program outcomes for new and renewal applicants, or whether other metrics should be included.
- 8) Authorizes the K-12 component of the SWP to create, support, or expand high-quality CTE programs at the K-12 level that are aligned with the workforce development efforts occurring through the SWP, and authorizes, commencing with the 2018-19 fiscal year, and subject to an annual appropriation, \$150 million to be apportioned annually by the California Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) to local consortia. (EC 88827)

- 9) Establishes the California Golden State Pathways Program (GSPP) to provide LEAs with the resources to promote pathways in high-wage, high-skill, high-growth areas, including technology, health care, education, and climate-related fields that, among other things, allow students to advance seamlessly from high school to college and career and provide the workforce needed for economic growth. (EC 53020)
- 10) Federal law, the Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act, reauthorizes the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006 (Perkins) and provides federal support for CTE programs and focuses on improving the academic and technical achievement of CTE students, strengthening the connections between secondary and postsecondary education and improving accountability.

FISCAL EFFECT: Unknown

COMMENTS:

Need for the bill. According to the author, “AB 1929 will collect data, by race, for Career Technical Education (CTE) programs. Historically, African Americans have been tracked into low quality vocational programs. We cannot repeat these failures and need to see who is participating and what the outcomes are. AB 1929 will better inform our decision making to increase enrollment to make sure that African Americans are participating in high quality CTE programs and set them up to be successful in current and emerging professions.”

Defining Career Technical Education. CTE prepares students for the world of work by introducing them to workplace competencies and makes academic content accessible to students by providing it in a hands-on context. Along the way, students develop career-relevant, real-world 21st Century skills.

CTE is a program of study that involves a multiyear sequence of courses that integrates core academic knowledge with technical and occupational knowledge to provide students with a pathway to postsecondary education and careers. CTE programs in California are organized into 15 industry sectors, covering 58 pathways that identify the knowledge and skills students need. Partnerships are usually developed between high schools, businesses, and postsecondary schools, providing pathways to employment and associate, Bachelor’s, and advanced degrees.

CTE courses and pathways may be offered in comprehensive high schools with CTE programs, as well as through regional CTE programs or centers operated by JPAs or COEs. Some CTE programs are blended with academic programs in what is known as a “linked learning model.” Community colleges and technical institutes also offer CTE at the postsecondary level.

Improved outcomes for CTE students. A wide body of research indicates that involvement in CTE coursework provides improved academic outcomes and other benefits to students with findings, such as the following:

- Students with greater exposure to CTE are more likely to graduate from high school, enroll in a two-year college, be employed, and earn higher wages;
- The average high school graduation rate for students concentrating in CTE programs is 93%, compared to an average national graduation rate of 80%;

- Students taking more CTE classes are just as likely to pursue a four-year degree as their peers;
- 91% of high school graduates who earned 2-3 CTE credits enrolled in college;
- CTE provides the greatest boost to students who need it most – boys and students from low-income families; and
- 80% of students taking a college preparatory academic curriculum with rigorous CTE met college and career readiness goals, compared to only 63% of students taking the same academic core who did not experience rigorous CTE.

College and career readiness is a state priority. Each LEA’s Local Control and Accountability Plan (LCAP) must demonstrate, among other priorities, how they are ensuring that all students are being prepared to be college and career ready. The College and Career Readiness Index displayed on each LEA’s dashboard includes data on the number of students completing a CTE pathway. State level data for 2023 shows that overall 43.9% of high school graduates are considered “prepared” on the College/Career Indicator. When comparing subgroups, 25.1% of African American students, 35.5% of Hispanic students, 53.2% of White students, and 75.8% of Asian students were considered prepared.

Current K-12 CTE programs. There are a number of initiatives supporting K-12 CTE programs supported by state and federal funds, including two large competitive grant programs offering ongoing funding:

- 1) **The Career Technical Education Incentive Grant (CTEIG) Program** was originally established in 2015 as a one-time investment of \$900 million to cover a three-year span and acted as a bridge for LEAs to support CTE programs until the Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF) was fully funded. It was created as a state education, economic, and workforce development initiative to provide students in kindergarten through grade twelve with the knowledge and skills necessary to transition from secondary education to postsecondary education and living-wage employment. The purpose of the program is to encourage, maintain, and strengthen the delivery of high-quality CTE programs. The program is administered by the CDE. In 2018, ongoing funding of \$150 million for CTEIG was appropriated. In 2021, the annual funding for CTEIG was increased to \$300 million.

Prior to the adoption of the LCFF, the state provided funding for CTE through a number of categorical programs, including the Regional Occupational Centers/Programs (ROC/P), which was funded at \$400 million at the time. This funding was folded into the Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF), increasing the LCFF base rate for high schools by 2.6%.

Grants are awarded under the CTEIG program by CDE, in consultation with the SBE, in response to applications submitted by LEAs outlining the ways in which they meet the statutorily defined requirements, including a 2:1 match of local to state funding. For the 2022-23 fiscal year, the CDE received 383 applications from LEAs. A total of \$266 million has been allocated to the 375 eligible applicants. A second round of funding allocated an additional \$2.3 million to 5 eligible applicants.

- 2) **The K-12 Strong Workforce Program (K-12 SWP)** was established in 2018 as a component of the Community Colleges' SWP to create, support, or expand high-quality CTE programs at the secondary level that are aligned with the workforce development efforts occurring through the SWP. As is the case for CTEIG, the K-12 SWP is meant to support the overall development of high-quality K-12 CTE programs, courses, course sequences, programs of study, and pathways. The program is administered by the CCCCO. The program is currently funded at \$150 million per year.

Unlike the CTEIG program, which is administered at the state level, the CCCCO allocates K-12 SWP grant funding to eight regional consortia according to a statutory formula. Each regional consortium is required to administer a competitive grant program it receives to LEAs in the region. Each consortium establishes a selection committee made up of individuals with expertise in K-12 CTE and workforce development, including teachers, administrators, community college faculty or administrators, and other K-12 education stakeholders. Employees of LEAs applying for grants under the program may serve as members of the selection committees. Each selection committee has exclusive authority under state law to determine the recipients of K-12 SWP grants in its region and the specific amount for each grant. For the 2022-23 fiscal year, 224 individual pathways were funded for a total allocation of \$143.7 million.

California Reparations Report calls for actions to improve educational outcomes for African American students. On June 29, 2023, the Task Force to Study and Develop Reparation Proposals for African Americans issued its final report to the California Legislature. The final report surveys the ongoing and compounding harms experienced by African Americans as a result of slavery and its lingering effects on American society today and proposes a comprehensive reparations plan in satisfaction of the direction set forth by the Legislature in AB 3121 (Weber) Chapter 319, Statutes of 2020.

The report notes that, based on data from the U.S. Department of Education's Civil Rights data collection from 2014 to 2018, African American students continue to face multiple educational disparities, including fewer resources and large and persistent opportunity and achievement gaps. African American students are less likely to attend schools that offer advanced coursework and math and science courses, and they are less likely to be placed in gifted and talented programs.

The Task Force recommends that the Legislature commit the level of funding needed to ensure that African American students across California, especially those who are descendants of persons enslaved in the U.S., have every educational resource, support, and intervention needed to end persistent racial disparities, permanently close the opportunity gap, and allow every student to thrive.

The Center for American Progress notes that "schools have historically tracked African American students into low-quality vocational programs as an extension of Jim Crow-era segregation (Smith, 2019). High quality CTE programs offer an essential tool to prepare students for careers in current or emerging professions and as such, offer an essential tool to remedy this persisting discrimination. (Stevens, 2015)

In order to address the ongoing effects of racial discrimination and inequality in employment, education, and wealth, the Task Force recommendations include collecting and disaggregating data about CTE enrollment in California by race, as proposed by this bill.

CDE collects data on student demographics, including race/ethnicity. According to the CDE, they support past and present initiatives to collect student demographic data on race/ethnicity. Last year, the California Workforce Pathways Joint Advisory Committee (CWPJAC) adopted the California State Plan for Career Technical Education, which sets forth specific state goals and strategies to improve access and outcomes for California’s students and workforce. According to the plan, the state intends to develop a statewide, common framework for equity in CTE. This includes the collection of race/ethnicity demographic data, as it relates to CTE, to identify equity gaps and leverage data to inform decisions on related state policies and investments. The CDE reports race/ethnicity data on students who have graduated high school and completed a CTE pathway. This is reported as part of the College/Career Indicator on the California School Dashboard Additional Reports. The race/ethnicity and student group data are reported at the school, district, and county levels consistent with accountability reporting requirements.

Participation in CTE courses varies by race/ethnicity. A 2023 report by Policy Analysis for California Education (PACE) notes that CTE pathway completion has been stable over time, with approximately one fifth of California public high school graduates having completed at least one CTE pathway prior to graduation, but that this rate of completion varies across racial/ethnic groups with roughly 20% of Latinx, White, and Asian American students completing a CTE pathway in high school, while approximately 15% of Black students did so.

Many of the racial/ethnic subgroups tend to be overrepresented or underrepresented in each of the 15 industry sectors. The following table shows the degree to which Black students are under or over-represented by comparing the proportion of Black students in a graduating cohort and the proportion of Black students in that industry pathway. The greatest disparities are in agriculture, building and construction, manufacturing, and transportation, while Black students are slightly overrepresented in the fashion and marketing pathways.

Industry sector	Black students underrepresented	Black students overrepresented
Arts, media, and entertainment	5%	
Agriculture and natural resources	69%	
Building and construction	46%	
Business and finance	5%	
Engineering and architecture	30%	
Education and child development	28%	
Energy, environment, and utilities		
Fashion & interior design		9%
Health sciences and medical technology	10%	
Hospitality, tourism, and recreation	10%	
Information and communication technology	24%	
Manufacturing and product development	55%	
Marketing, sales, and services		7%
Public service	11%	
Transportation	65%	

Source: PACE, 2023

Arguments in support. Alameda County Office of Education writes, “Alameda County Office of Education is committed to increasing all students’ access to career preparation programs. Currently, there is an underrepresentation of descendants of enslaved people in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) and related career technical education (CTE) programs at the high school and college levels. AB 1929 aims to rectify this racial disparity by collecting data disaggregated by race on levels of participation and outcomes of descendants of enslaved people in programs such as CTEIG and SWP.

Related legislation. AB 3131 (McCarty) of the 2023-24 Session would requires that the CDE and the Executive Director of the SBE, in determining proposed grant recipients for the CTEIG program, give priority consideration to applicants in historically redlined communities, as determined by the CDE and requires the K-12 Strong Workforce Program K-12 selection committees to give priority consideration to applicants in historically redlined communities.

AB 2273 (Holden) of the 2023-24 Session would establish the California Pilot Paid Internship Program with an appropriation of \$12 million for the California Department of Education (CDE) to provide grants to LEAs to support paid internships for students in 12th grade, through public-private partnerships.

AB 377 (Muratsuchi) of the 2023-24 Session would have required the consolidation of specified K-12 CTE programs, increased ongoing funding for the CTEIG program administered by the CDE to \$450 million per year; required specified CTE staffing at the state and regional level to support local CTE programs and pathways; and deleted authorization for the K-12 SWP administered by the CCCCO. This bill was held by the Senate Appropriations Committee.

AB 2058 (O’Donnell) of the 2021-22 Session was substantially similar to AB 377 (as noted above). This bill was held in the Senate Education Committee.

AB 181 (Committee on Budget) Chapter 52, Statutes of 2022, appropriates \$500 million in one-time Proposition 98 funding for the Golden State Pathways Program to support the development and implementation of college and career educational pathways in critically needed sectors of the economy. Authorizes the CDE to contract with up to 10 LEAs for the provision of technical assistance to LEAs, applicants, and grant recipients.

AB 1923 (Mathis) Chapter 114, Statutes of 2022, requires the SPI to prioritize proposals for new California Partnership Academies based on a school district’s enrollment of socioeconomically disadvantaged students, and for school districts located in a rural or economically disadvantaged area.

AB 130 (Committee on Budget) Chapter 44, Statutes of 2021, provides that, for the 2021–22 fiscal year and each fiscal year thereafter, \$300 million would be made available to the CDE, upon appropriation for the CTEIG program. Also makes adjustments to program provisions relating to eligibility requirements for grant applicants, and for ensuring compliance with program requirements.

AB 3121 (Weber) Chapter 319, Statutes of 2020, establishes an eight-member task force to study the issue of reparations for African Americans; propose ways to educate the California public about its findings; make recommendations on the forms that reparations might take; and submit a report of its findings to the Legislature.

AB 1808 (Committee on Budget) Chapter 32, Statutes of 2018, appropriates in the 2018–19 fiscal year and each fiscal year thereafter, \$150 million to the CTEIG program administered through CDE. Also establishes a K–12 component of the SWP to create, support, or expand high-quality CTE programs at the K–12 level aligned with the workforce development efforts and, commencing with the 2018–19 fiscal year, requires the CCCCO to allocate \$150 million for this program to regional CTE consortia.

AB 1743 (O’Donnell) of the 2017-18 Session would have extended funding for CTEIG Program by providing ongoing funding of \$500 million per year with a 1:1 local match as well as \$12 million per year for regional K-12 CTE coordinators to provide technical assistance and support to local CTE providers. This bill was held in the Senate Education Committee.

AB 104 (Committee on Budget) Chapter 13, Statutes of 2015, establishes the CTEIG, a competitive grant program administered by the CDE, to provide support for career technical education in grades K-12, and provides \$400 million in 2015-16, \$300 million in 2016-17, and \$200 million in 2017-18 for this program.

REGISTERED SUPPORT / OPPOSITION:**Support**

Alameda County Office of Education

Opposition

None on file

Analysis Prepared by: Debbie Look / ED. / (916) 319-2087