Date of Hearing: June 13, 2018

ASSEMBLY COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION Patrick O'Donnell, Chair SB 947 (Jackson) – As Amended May 25, 2018

SENATE VOTE: 25-13

SUBJECT: Pupil instruction: digital citizenship and media literacy

SUMMARY: Requires the Superintendent of Public Instruction (SPI), on or before December 1, 2019, and in consultation with an advisory committee, to identify best practices and recommendations for instruction in digital citizenship, internet safety, and media literacy. Specifically, **this bill**:

- Requires the SPI, on or before December 1, 2019, and in consultation with the executive director of the State Board of Education (SBE) and an advisory committee, to identify best practices and recommendations for instruction in digital citizenship, internet safety, and media literacy, and to report to the appropriate fiscal and policy committees of the Legislature on strategies to implement the best practices and recommendations statewide.
- 2) Requires the best practices and recommendations to be developed in consultation with an advisory committee, convened by the SPI, which must include representatives from all of the following:
 - a) California County Superintendents Educational Services Association
 - b) California School Boards Association
 - c) Experts in digital citizenship, internet safety, and media literacy
 - d) Other stakeholders, including pupils, certificated teacher librarians, parent organizations, diverse current classroom teachers, and administrators
- Requires that the advisory committee be comprised of a majority of certificated teacher librarians and current certificated classroom teachers with experience teaching media literacy.
- 4) States that recommendations from the advisory committee may include:
 - a) Revisions to the state learning standards and the state educational technology plan.
 - b) Model policies and procedures on digital citizenship, internet safety, and media literacy developed by the School Superintendents Association.
 - c) School district processes necessary to develop customized school district policies and procedures on electronic resources and internet safety that can be used within a school district technology plan.

- d) Best practices, resources, and models for instruction in digital citizenship, internet safety, and media literacy.
- e) Best practices, resources, and models for instruction that are compliant with the federal Universal Service E-rate program administered by the Schools and Libraries Division of the Universal Service Administrative Company and mandates established in the federal Children's Internet Protection Act.
- f) Strategies that will support school districts in local implementation of the best practices and recommendations developed by the department, including strategies for delivering professional development to educators and administrators.
- 5) States that members of the advisory committee shall serve without compensation, including travel and per diem expenses, and requires that any meeting of the advisory committee be audio-only recorded and made available to the public on the California Department of Education's (CDE) website.

EXISTING LAW:

- 1) Requires the SPI to establish procedures within the CDE to:
 - a) Annually identify the critical needs for which effective educational programs and practices are to be identified, developed, and disseminated to public schools.
 - b) Coordinate the identification and development of effective programs and practices with appropriate offices in the CDE, schools, school districts, county offices of education, institutions of higher education, the Legislature, business and industry, and the community.
 - c) Ensure that all programs developed are objectively evaluated for impact on pupil learning, cost-effectiveness, and the overall instructional program.
 - d) Develop and implement procedures to ensure that educators throughout the state are made aware of effective programs and practices.
- 2) Establishes the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC), as an advisory body to the SBE. The IQC is responsible for recommending curriculum frameworks, developing criteria for the evaluation of instructional materials, and evaluating and recommending instructional materials adoptions.

FISCAL EFFECT: According to the Senate Appropriations Committee:

- Any costs to the CDE are expected to be minor and absorbable within existing resources.
- There could be local cost pressure to implement the best practices and recommendations, including new content standards. To implement any new courses, school districts would have to purchase instructional materials and either hire appropriate teachers or provide professional development to existing teachers. These costs would not be reimbursable by the state.

COMMENTS:

Need for the bill. The author's office states, "Media and technology have become commonplace in almost every area of modern life. Just like adults, today's kids in California have more access to media, the internet, and mobile technologies at home and in school than any previous generation. While media and technology hold great promise for enhancing how our children learn, young people need support and education regarding how to make sound judgments when navigating their digital world. Particularly in our classrooms and other school settings, today's children must learn how to safely, ethically, and responsibly interact with one another, as well as learn how to effectively use media and technology resources at their disposal.

Currently, there are no comprehensive standards for teaching students about aspects of digital citizenship (i.e., cyber bullying, sexting, privacy, digital footprints, and "fake news"). With the right tools, our schools can play a critical role in educating, empowering, and engaging children with best practices around consuming and producing media, digitally interacting with one another, and staying safe online."

Curriculum, standards, frameworks, and model curricula. California's public school curriculum is based on content standards in various subjects, including English-Language Arts, Mathematics, Science, History-Social Science, Physical Education, English Language Development, Career Technical Education, Health Education, World Languages, and Visual and Performing Arts. These standards are developed by the IQC through a public process, and are adopted by the SBE.

These standards form the basis of California's curriculum frameworks. The frameworks guide the implementation of these standards, and are used to establish criteria for the evaluation of instructional materials for state adoption for grades kindergarten through grade eight, and guide district selection of instructional materials for grades nine through twelve. In addition to developing standards in the above subject areas, the SPI is has been directed by law to develop model curricula on different topics, such as those on the life of Cesar Chavez, human rights and genocide, and ethnic studies, for voluntary use by educators.

What are digital citizenship and media literacy? According to the CDE, a digital citizen is a member of a worldwide community linked by the internet. Digital citizenship is defined as the quality of habits, actions, and consumption patterns that impact the ecology of digital content and communities or the quality of a response to membership in a digital community.

According to the National Association for Media Literacy Education, media literacy is the ability to access, analyze, evaluate and create media in a variety of forms. The Center for Media Literacy offers another definition: "Media literacy empowers people to be both critical thinkers and creative producers of an increasingly wide range of messages using image, language, and sound. It is the skillful application of literacy skills to media and technology messages."

What does media literacy education look like? Three examples of media literacy lessons which were developed for different grades are shown below:

Through the Media Smarts curriculum (in use in Canada) students in Kindergarten to third grade can learn how to identify advertising through a lesson titled "Can you spot the ad?" with the

objective of teaching students about the concept of branded content, and differences between branded and non-branded images and videos in online and offline contexts.

Through the Cyber Civics curriculum for middle school students, students learn the difference between "consuming" and "producing" media, how to read and create visual media and become less susceptible to visual manipulations, receive safety training related to the consequences of "sexting," and learn how misinformation can spread via the internet and social media and even find its way into the news.

Through the Facing History and Ourselves media literacy unit titled "Facing Ferguson: News Literacy in a Digital Age," high school students investigate the choices and challenges facing journalists as they report on a story, explore the impact of social media on the traditional news cycle and understand the role it can play in influencing public opinion and the press, develop critical thinking and news literacy skills to help students find reliable information to make decisions, take action, and responsibly share news through social media, and consider their role as citizens in a democracy and their responsibilities as civic participants and citizen watchdogs.

Information literacy in California Model School Library standards. The California Model School Library Standards for California Schools, adopted by the SBE in 2011, incorporate "information literacy" skills, in which students "learn to access, evaluate, use, and integrate information and ideas found in print, media, and digital resources, enabling them to function in a knowledge-based economy and technologically oriented society." "Information" is defined broadly to include words (whether printed or spoken), visual images (including photographs and artwork), and music.

The standards are organized into four concepts (accessing, evaluating, using, and integrating information) which contain standards spanning all of the grades. In the area of evaluating information, students are expected to be able to determine the relevance of information; assess the comprehensiveness, currency, credibility, authority, and accuracy of resources; and consider the need for additional information.

The state's content standards for English Language Arts students also include at least one reference to media literacy. In grades 9 -12 students are expected to learn to "Integrate multiple sources of information presented in diverse media or formats (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) evaluating the credibility and accuracy of each source."

The model curriculum proposed by this bill would serve as a resource for educators wishing to focus on media literacy instruction, at any grade level. It would also bring more focus to media literacy as an important set of skills for students to acquire.

Media literacy legislation in other states. According to the organization Media Literacy Now, as of 2017, a number of states have adopted or are in the process of adopting legislation to address the education of students in media literacy, digital citizenship, and internet safety. They include: Arizona, New Mexico, Massachusetts, Connecticut, New York, Rhode Island, Washington, New Jersey, Utah, Florida, Ohio, and Illinois. States are adopting a variety of strategies, from incorporating media literacy content into state health or safety curricula, to creating elective courses, to making digital citizenship instruction a responsibility of school librarians.

Recommended amendments. Staff recommends the following amendments to this bill:

- 1) Require consultation with the State Board of Education (rather than the Executive Director of the State Board of Education).
- 2) Change the names of specific associations to references to statewide organizations.
- 3) Change the description of model policies developed by the School Superintendents Association to "existing model policies..." with no reference to a specific organization.
- 4) Change "learning standards" to "content standards."
- 5) Delete a reference to a specific company (Universal Service Administrative Company).
- 6) State that nothing in the act shall be construed to limit the use of private funds for the compensation or travel expenses of members of the advisory committee.
- 7) Make the meetings of the advisory committee subject to the Bagley Keene Act.

Related and prior legislation. SB 830 (Dodd) of this Session would require the IQC to develop, and the SBE to adopt, reject, or modify, a model curriculum in media literacy.

SB 135 (Dodd) of this Session would have required the IQC to develop, and the SBE to adopt, reject, or modify, a model curriculum in media literacy. This bill was held in the Assembly Appropriations Committee.

SB 203 (Jackson) of this Session would have required the CDE to identify best practices and recommendations for instruction in digital citizenship, internet safety, and media literacy, and requires, beginning in the 2019–20 school year, school districts to annually review their policies on those topics. This bill was held in the Senate Appropriations Committee.

SB 155 (Gomez) of this Session would have required the IQC to develop a model curriculum in media literacy, and requires the CDE to develop an online professional development module to support the model curriculum. This bill was held in the Assembly Appropriations Committee.

REGISTERED SUPPORT / OPPOSITION:

Support

California Newspaper Publishers Association California School Boards Association California School Library Association California State PTA California Teachers Association Center for Media Literacy Common Sense Kids Action Junior Leagues of California Los Angeles County Office of Education

Opposition

None on file

Analysis Prepared by: Tanya Lieberman / ED. / (916) 319-2087